

Encyclopedia will reaffirm the faith of most LDS people. There are numerous highly qualified scholars among its authors, and they have produced many excellent articles; but it is difficult to suppress the suspicion that many of them have been mutilated by the editors somewhere along the line.

The church is now approaching the end of its second century, and its people are intellectually mature and firm in their faith and are able to handle things

in a less sanitized form. They deserve something better. In his review, Richard Poll indicated that the very short time consumed in producing the 1,128 written articles struck the publisher as a small miracle. Perhaps Macmillan should have advised the editor to take more time. It is comforting to know from the preface that "In no sense does the *Encyclopedia* have the force and authority of scripture" (lxii).

Women's Place in the *Encyclopedia*

Encyclopedia of Mormonism: The History, Scripture, Doctrine, and Procedure of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. 4 vols. Daniel H. Ludlow, editor in chief. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1992. 1,848 pp., index, maps, illustrations, appendices, and glossary.

Reviewed by Lavina Fielding Anderson, contemporary issues editor of the *Mormon Women's Forum Newsletter*.

WHEN THE *ENCYCLOPEDIA OF MORMONISM* project was first announced with its all-male board of editors, I developed a keen interest in how women's issues would be handled and was delighted when two women were later added to the board. I anticipated the appearance of the finished *Encyclopedia* and accepted with alacrity the invitation of *Dialogue* to write a review focused on women's issues.

I first scanned the list of contributors, looking for the names of women. The acknowledgements express appreciation to 738 authors; there are actually

748, a fact easy to determine from the handsomely designed list of contributors in Volume 1. Of this number, 618 are men, 127 are women, and three may have been either from their names. Women thus account for about 20.5 percent of the total, a respectable though modest number.

Of name entries, twenty-two are devoted to women while more than seventy are devoted to men. Although no living individual besides President Benson is included, the coverage is still puzzlingly spotty. Of the seven Young Women general presidents, five of whom are dead, two are featured in separate entries but the other three are not. Of the seven Primary general presidents, five of whom are dead, only one is featured. Of the twelve Relief Society general presidents, all ten dead women have separate entries. "Ruth" has a separate entry but not "Esther." I would have cheerfully exchanged such quaint topics as "burnings everlasting," "Sword of Laban," "Ezias," "lightmindedness," "strait and narrow," "theogony," and

"theodicy," for more women's biographical entries. Furthermore, the space devoted to the Book of Mormon is excessive, even for a Book of Mormon lover such as I—154 columns plus thirty-nine separate entries on books and characters.

Encouragingly, rather than being confined to a ghetto of "women's topics," women authors deal with a significant number of doctrinal and theological topics, including Elouise Bell's entry on "holiness," M. Catherine Thomas's on "hell," Vivian Paulsen's on "love," and Cheryl Brown's on "obedience" among many others.

I give the *Encyclopedia* full marks on topics. Elaine Anderson Cannon's entry on "Mother in Heaven" avers that "the belief in a living Mother in Heaven is implicit in Latter-day Saint thought" and carefully reconstructs the scriptural "hints" of such a personage (2:961). Mary Stovall Richards's evenhanded entry on feminism presents a definition to which most should be able to subscribe ("the philosophical belief that advocates the equality of women and men and seeks to remove inequities and to redress injustices against women"), acknowledges that Mormon doctrine "converges in some areas with the ideals of feminism and diverges in others," and empoweringly claims: "Such equality of women and men is based on the celestial model of heavenly parents, both Father and Mother" (2:507).

Extremely useful is the lengthy and profusely illustrated article on "Vital Statistics" by Tim B. Heaton (4:1518-37). In addition to the usual demographic information, it deals directly with women-related issues as fertility (after paralleling the U.S. curve at a considerably higher level for sixty years, it nose-dived sharply, starting in 1980, while the U.S. rate was remaining level), gender

ratios (women outnumber men everywhere but Africa; and for single members over thirty who attend church weekly, the ratio is 19 men per 100 women), temple marriages (percentages range from about 45 in Utah to less than 2 in Mexico), household composition (only 20 percent match the *Ensign* cover of a temple married couple with children under eighteen), and employment (about half). Unfortunately, there is no cross-reference to another extremely important article, "Single Adults," by Lawrence A. Young, which contains such illuminating information about women as: (1) only 51 percent of women between eighteen and thirty in 1981 will be in an intact first marriage by age sixty, (2) female-headed households are 2.5-5.5 times as likely to be below the poverty level as couple-headed household, (3) 42 percent of never-married women over thirty have four years of college compared to 18 percent of never-married men and 70 percent have professional occupations compared to 38 percent of men. This article also documents discrimination in callings extended to singles (3:1316-19). (See also Stephen J. Bahr's article on "Social Characteristics" which identifies the "ideal" number of children as four for more than 50 percent of Latter-day Saints, compared with "two" for every other religious group [3:1372]).

Patricia Terry Holland's entry on "Motherhood" must be read with its companion entry, "Fatherhood" (2:503-504), by A. Lynn Scoresby, since she nowhere mentions a husband/father's contributions. (Scoresby presents a much more partner-focused portrait of parenting.) Holland, in contrast, presents a romanticized and pious view of motherhood: "The ultimate responsibility of a mother, then, is to lead her child lovingly through its personal develop-

ment and toward its divine destiny. Latter-day Saints believe that if a mother is prayerful and totally committed to such a weighty responsibility, she will receive divine intuitions and spiritual whisperings to aid her in her mothering. Living as a conduit for divine instruction to her child . . ." (2:962).

A major article is the entry on "Women, Roles of." It is disappointing that this important article is limited to slightly more than seven columns while, due to lopsidedness in editorial priorities, William O. Nelson's article on "anti-Mormon literature" consumes more than twelve. The first part, by Martha Nibley Beck, "Historical and Sociological Development," is significant and clearly written. "The Church's female membership always played a central role in ensuring the success of Mormonism," she states, then documents the creation and adaptation of an ecclesiastical and social identity for Mormon women from the 1830s (they "received personal revelation, healed the sick, prophesied future events . . .") to the present ("Secular analyses set the attainment of an individual's personal goals or advancement in opposition to dedication to the family; LDS belief defines the two as inextricably intertwined") (4:1575-76). Barbara B. Smith and Shirley W. Thomas, co-authors of the second half of the article, "Gospel Principles and the Roles of Women," present a commendably moderate and positive view of women's roles. "She may fill many roles simultaneously. . . . The companionship role . . . is not limited to the husband and wife partnership but includes women serving cooperatively with men. . . . Underlying the companionship role is the inherent equality of men and women . . . The receipt of spiritual gifts is conditional on obedience, not gender . . . Latter-day Saint women

are taught from their youth to prepare for marriage and homemaking, as well as for a vocation. . . . The Church does not oppose women working outside the home per se . . . but it is hoped that whenever possible, mothers with children in the home will make home their priority career") (4:1575-77). Victor L. Brown Jr.'s companion article, "Men, Roles of," focuses intently on Jesus Christ as the model for male identity and behavior.

In contrast, the treatment of many topics is disappointingly conservative and brief. For example, the entry on abortion, authored by Mary K. Beard, consists of twenty-six lines, all but seven of them quotations from Elder Boyd K. Packer or the *General Handbook of Instructions* (1:6). (It follows an article on Abinadi, which retells the Book of Mormon story for 139 lines.) Interestingly, a later article on "social characteristics" identifies Latter-day Saints as "the least accepting" of abortion out of all religious groups but still says that 67 percent favor abortion if the fetus is deformed (3:1376).

The entry on "Premarital Sex" is a homily that includes no statistics on premarital pregnancy. The entry on "Abuse, Spouse and Child," is thirty-eight lines long and is directed exclusively at abusers—defining abuse, telling them that they are committing a sin, instructing them to counsel with "their bishops and, where necessary, [receive] professional help," but reassuring them that they "can be forgiven when they truly repent." I reread the entry three times, looking in vain for any material directed toward the victim—reassurance, for instance, of innocence, of ecclesiastical support, or of encouragement to seek professional help or of a breath of acknowledgement of the trauma and pain endured. There was

not a syllable. There was also no cross reference to "Satanism," an entry which completely ignores ritual abuse. Even more seriously, there is no cross reference to "Policies, Practices, and Procedures" where, at last, one brief quotation from the *General Handbook of Instruction* acknowledges, under the heading, "Rape or Sexual Abuse Victims," that "victims of the evil acts of others are not guilty of sin" (3:1096). A parallel passage in the entry on sexuality is not indexed (3:1307). *Incest* likewise does not appear in the index although it is briefly mentioned in both places.

The entry on "cancellation of sealings" is perfunctory (3:1290). It completely omits the humiliating and painful differential treatment of men and women. A divorced husband may, if worthy, be sealed to a second wife without the consent or even the knowledge of the first wife; but a divorced wife cannot cancel her sealing, even to an abusive or abandoning husband, without consulting him and until she is approaching another temple marriage.

The *Encyclopedia* also contains extremely interesting snippets of information about women and also omissions. The activity of U.S. adult members in 1989 stood at 48 percent with women accounting for higher rates of activity (percentage unspecified) than men (1:14). A photograph illustrating "members" of the Eket Branch in Nigeria is composed entirely of women and children (1:22). Victor Cline's entry on "pornography" correctly points out its inaccurate and unhealthy sexual information and its risk of "conditioning viewers" to accept "violence and aggression against females" as norms (3:1112). He, perhaps purposely, refers to the pornography consumer as "he." The entry on homosexuality by Victor L. Brown, Jr., defines it as "sinful . . . comparable to

sexual relations between any unmarried persons" for which the church "offers counseling" but for which it may also take disciplinary action (2:656). The entry is written to apply to both men and women; there is no index entry for "lesbian." Both this entry and Terrance Olson's positively written entry on sexuality stress "legal heterosexual marriage" as the divinely ordained state (3:1306). Nephi K. Kezerian's entry on "Sick, Blessing the" contains no acknowledgement that this was historically one of the spiritual gifts practiced by Mormon women (3:1308).

The politics of such a project are, of course, intriguing. Someone will one day correlate the authors' list with the BYU catalogue to determine what percentage of the religion faculty (compared with those from other BYU departments) were contributors. Advisors to the project were Elders Neal A. Maxwell and Dallin H. Oaks. Their duties are not specified, nor are those of four Seventies "who accepted special assignments"—Elders Dean L. Larsen, Carlos E. Asay, Marlin K. Jensen, and Jeffrey R. Holland. The special assignments were not writing assignments, for only Elder Holland is also one of the eight general authorities who is also an author.

It is possible, though completely tentative without corroborating evidence, to trace in the selection of authors and topics the operation of a list of the ecclesiastically acceptable. According to the preface, articles were invited from those who had manifested "previous interest and study" (lxi) in their topics. Eugene England, whose criticism, teaching, and creating of Mormon literature, especially personal essays, has been second to none for the past fifteen years is not listed among the authors on any topic. Carol Cornwall Madsen, a superb

historian and a gifted writer, is the logical person to have written about Emmeline B. Wells, whose important diary she is preparing for publication. But she is not the logical person to write about Emma Hale Smith, given the easy accessibility of Linda King Newell and Valeen Tippetts Avery, co-authors of *Emma Hale Smith: Mormon Enigma*, which is still the definitive biography on the subject. I yield to none in my admiration of Dean Jessee's historical contributions, an admiration sustained by his entries on Joseph Smith and his writings. But Thomas G. Alexander, author of the MHA-award-winning biography of Wilford Woodruff, *Things in Heaven and Earth*, not Dean Jessee, is the logical person to have written on that president of the church. D. Michael Quinn's trail-breaking works on post-Manifesto polygamy and magic world views in Joseph Smith's day are slighted; he does not appear as an author on any topic, nor is he cited in Danel Bachman and Ronald K. Esplin's entry on "plural marriage" which rather ingenuously claims, "Some new plural marriages were contracted in the 1890s . . . in Canada and northern Mexico, and a few elsewhere" (3:1095), thus leaving the impression that there were none after 1900. Claudia L. Bushman, author of a recently published book on *Christopher Columbus*, was passed over in favor of Louise G. Hanson who is identified with the line "Brigham Young University" in the author list but who is not listed in its 1992-93 directory of faculty and staff. I have been researching, writing about, and presenting papers on the history of the YWMA/Young Women's program since 1982; but Elaine Anderson Cannon, an ecclesiastically appropriate choice as a former Young Women's general president, wrote the encyclopedia article. Sherilyn Cox Bennion's years of

research on women's publications were also ignored; Shirley W. Thomas and Patrea Gillespie Kelley, neither of whom has published on their topics, wrote the entries on the *Woman's Exponent* and the *Young Woman's Journal* respectively. Although Gary Smith and Irene Bates have been collaborating on their history of the patriarchs to the church since 1980, Calvin R. Stephens wrote the bland entry on that topic. Such internal sifting and sorting according to secret criteria is ungenerous and unworthy of scholars. A future researcher will one day trace the percentage of entries whose genesis lies in the independent publications (*Dialogue* receives one paragraph in the entry on "Societies and Organizations"), with or without adequate citation. It is highly commendable that Jan Shipps can give "an independent interpretation" (and an interesting one!) of Mormonism, Richard P. Howard can describe the RLDS church and its history (Alma Blair wrote the entry on Haun's Mill and Robert Bruce Flanders on Nauvoo's economy), Krister Stendahl of Harvard Divinity School can describe ancient sources for "baptism for the dead," and R. J. Zvi Werblowky of Hebrew University can contribute his insights on ancient sources of "Elijah." But it will seem even more ludicrous to historians of the future that the hand of fellowship has been extended across religious barriers to these scholars while being denied to believing professionals.

In a lay church without professional theologians, it is not surprising to find a disproportionate number of BYU religion faculty and Church Educational System personnel (where women can be numbered on one hand) handling doctrinal topics; but it is more difficult to explain why the relatively small handful of Mormon women with serious publications on theological topics and/or

theological training were overlooked, including Melodie Moench Charles, Jolene Edmunds Rockwood (publicist Beverly Campbell is the rather improbable author of the entry on Eve and it clearly owes much to Rockwood), Bonnie Bobet, Peggy Fletcher Stack, Margaret Merrill Toscano, and Janice Merrill Allred.

The physical presentation of the *Encyclopedia* is a stunning success. Handsomely designed and laid out for maximum readability, it is generously illustrated with high-quality photographs. It is paginated continuously through the four volumes, which is helpful; but volume numbers are omitted from the contents and index, which means that the reader usually has to try at least a couple of volumes to find the right one. The technical production seems to have been carefully done with relatively few and only minor lapses. The Thrasher Foundation is unaccountably written as "Thruler" (xlix). Clarissa Smith Williams is referred to in the contents and in the entry line without her maiden name, even though maiden names are scrupulously included for every other woman, as nearly as I could determine, in the entire encyclopedia (4:1567). Jill Mulvay Derr's name is incorrectly hyphenated in the contents

and on her competent articles on sisterhood and the Relief Society, coauthored with Janath R. Cannon. It is given correctly on the author list.

Carefully prepared and highly useful readers' aids are a synoptic outline (history, scriptures, doctrines, organization and government, and procedures and practices); thirteen appendices that include biographies of current officers, a historical chronology, a list of periodicals, excerpted doctrinal and historical documents, hymns, and membership figures. A glossary defines LDS terms.

Despite my reservations, I would still give high praise to the *Encyclopedia*. Of course it is a creation of its era, and the early 1990s are a time of escalating denial that there is any problem about the status and roles of Mormon women. The 1990s are also a time when the church's assertion of control over its intellectual and sociological components produce judgments about "approved" and "forbidden" topics and personnel that are frequently both nervous and unnecessary. The *Encyclopedia* will be an enduring benchmark, not only of Mormonism's fundamental doctrines and basic history, but also of the period that produced it.

"In Obedience There is Joy and Peace Unspotted"

B. Carmon Hardy. *Solemn Covenant: The Mormon Polygamous Passage*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1992. 362 pp., notes, illustrations, appendices.

Reviewed by M. Guy Bishop, who

teaches California history part time for the University of Southern California.

THE PROPHET JOSEPH SMITH ONCE TOLD Nancy Rigdon, whom he was attempting to persuade to become his plural