

of Joseph Smith and his new religion identified themselves with republican virtues.

Yet, *Exiles in a Land of Liberty* may lose some of its impact, at least with Mormon readers, because Winn never assigns any validity at all to the religion's claim about its divine origins. This is not to imply that *only* so-called faith-promoting history is acceptable, simply that Joseph Smith and his believing followers must be taken at face value, and Winn sometimes fails to do so. For example, in discussing events surrounding the coming forth of the Book of Mormon, Winn focuses on the "troubled financial condition" of Joseph Smith, Sr.'s family, suggesting that his son Joseph wrote the book for monetary gain (p. 15). Furthermore, Winn finds the Book of Mormon to be but a mirror of republicanism and disallows any possibility that it was what Smith claimed. Whether written just for profit or as a skillful interpretation of republicanism, the book still comes off in Winn's analysis as a clever fraud. In many ways Kenneth H. Winn's work is reminiscent of Fawn Brodie's *No Man Knows My History*. That path-breaking book, like *Exiles in a Land of Liberty*, provided solid, stimulating history but was marred, in places, by overt disbelief and cynicism. Yet, as scholars like Jan Shippo or Larry Foster have demonstrated, one need not be a believing Latter-day Saint to write Mormon history without appearing to imply culpability. I hope this shortcoming will not discourage potential readers from considering Winn's book, for it contains much thought-provoking material.

Winn casts Joseph Smith as the conservative defender of an older, crumbling America. Whether one treats Smith and his disciples as reacting to growing antebellum American pluralism, as does Marvin Hill in his recent *Quest for Refuge* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1989),

or as defending republican virtues like Winn, both studies are indications that early Mormon history is being skillfully analyzed by today's historians.

Chapter 3 of *Exiles in a Land of Liberty*, "Social Disorder and the Resurrection of Communal Republicanism among the Mormons," must be noted. Here Winn really draws together his understanding of Joseph Smith's success—which was, after all, phenomenal. Finding strong roots for Mormonism in Christian primitivism, Winn contends that when converts accepted Joseph Smith as a prophet of God, "their religious confusion and distress ended" (p. 51). Joseph Smith's revelations gave them a religious security, a self-confidence in being identified with God's chosen people and an assurance that they now had true religious knowledge. The similar reactions of many late twentieth-century Mormon converts magnify the importance of these insights.

Readers of *Exiles in a Land of Liberty* will also increase their knowledge of Mormonism's opponents. Like the Saints, these opponents were well-intentioned folk, but they simply disapproved of what they perceived as fakery and fraud. Those who could not, or would not, comprehend Mormon consecration and communalism saw Smith as the ultimate con man. They were convinced that more than one of his timely revelations smacked of deception. Perhaps *Exiles in a Promised Land* will serve as a reminder that all who opposed early Mormonism, or even the Church's more recent adversaries, were not simply evil people. That alone would seem a mighty contribution.

Winn's synthesis of early Mormonism is worth reading. He has done yeoman duty in offering yet another way of looking at Mormon roots. The serious student of the first two decades of Mormonism will do well to note this book.

## A Teenager's Mormon Battalion Journal

*The Gold Rush Diary of Azariah Smith*  
edited by David L. Bigler (Salt Lake City:

University of Utah Press, 1990), 159 pp.,  
\$17.50.

Reviewed by Allan Kent Powell, a historian at the Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City, Utah.

SINCE THE PUBLICATION of the Hosea Stout Journals in 1964, the University of Utah Press has made a significant contribution to the study of western history by publishing a number of important diaries, journals, and letter collections. *The Gold Discovery Journal of Azariah Smith*, ably edited by David L. Bigler, follows this valuable tradition and is a fine addition as volume 7 in the Publications in Mormon Studies Series edited by Linda King Newell.

Born in Boilston, Oswego County, New York, on 1 August 1828, Azariah Smith marched into Fort Leavenworth on his eighteenth birthday in 1846 as one of five hundred volunteers for the Mormon Battalion. Though one of the youngest members of the Battalion, Azariah Smith has become one of its most significant members since he was one of only two members who kept diaries about their experiences. The other diarist, Henry William Bigler, was thirteen years older than Smith. The Bigler diary has been available to historians for over a century and has been published in various versions, notably the 1932 volume of the *Utah Historical Quarterly* and a 1962 University of California Press volume edited by Erwin G. Gudde entitled *Bigler's Chronicle of the West: The Conquest of California, Discovery of Gold and Mormon Settlement as Reflected in Henry William Bigler's Diaries*. With the publication of the Smith diary, these two important primary sources about the Mormon Battalion experience and the historic discovery of gold at Sutter's Mill are now available to the public.

Azariah Smith begins his account with a brief biographical sketch noting that his parents, Albert and Esther Dutcher Smith, joined the Mormon church in 1839 and that he was baptized in 1841 at the age of thirteen. The Smiths lived in Ohio, Missouri, Iowa, and Illinois before moving to Council Bluffs where Azariah, his father, and his uncle Thomas P. Dutcher

enlisted in July 1846 as members of the Mormon Battalion.

Azariah's diary covers four significant periods in the saga of the Battalion: the march from Fort Leavenworth to Santa Fe and on to California; the occupation of California as federal soldiers; the discharge and subsequent participation in the discovery of gold at Sutter's Mill; and the journey from the gold fields to the Salt Lake Valley in the summer of 1848, in which Battalion members opened the Mormon-Carson Pass Emigrant Trail that would be used by tens of thousands of gold rushers in subsequent years.

While the journal has been used by students of the Mormon Battalion for some time and does not disclose any new or extraordinary information about the Battalion, it does reveal the wonder, innocence, and homesickness that was the experience of one young man during the two-year sojourn. It is a refreshing and insightful glimpse of a young man's initial encounter with the West. On the Santa Fe Trail near the Arkansas River in Kansas, 15 September 1846, Azariah noted: "We travailed today 15 miles, and crossed the river and camped by it on the other side, having to go a mile and a half after wood, I got on a mule and went after some. I got a stick on my shoulder, and got on the muel, but the mule threw me off and went to camp; it hurt me some, but not Seriously. Comeing back I saw a rattlesnake, which is the first one I have saw on the road" (p. 26).

After reaching Santa Fe, Azariah and his father attended Catholic mass, which Azariah describes with a good measure of tolerance and wonder: "They had a great many Images which [were] most beautiful; the Priest acted with great reverence, bowing and kissing the Images, and all sorts of motions. They also had good music. The people dispersed without much ceremony" (p. 32).

Impressed by the Catholic services, Smith returned again the next week and reported, "After the me[e]j[ing] I stayed to see the Ladies, some of which looked very prety, others looked like destruction" (p.