

laden conclusions on his own but he can do so on the basis of much more accurate information. The nonspecialist might have profited however, from more discussion of general banking and economic conditions during the 1830s. For example, the lack of a national bank, the ability of banks to issue their own currency and the generally more fluid milieu in which they operated at the time, tend to convey an image of chaos and disorder, an image too easily conjured up as a cause of the Kirtland bank's collapse and the Saints' difficulties.

The volume is well written and free of typographical blemish. It has four useful appendices, a bibliography, and an index, the latter not available in the *BYU Studies* version. I can't resist, however, calling attention to the references (pp. 59 and 87) to "Dudley Dean" as the author of a 1970 article on the Kirtland bank collapse. Dudley Dean is in fact the title character in a novel by Richard Scowcroft, a distant relative of mine. Dean A. Dudley is the economist in question. (His name is correct in the bibliography.)

TWO VENTURESOME WOMEN

by Cheryll Lynn May

Not By Bread Alone. The Journal of Martha Spence Heywood, 1850-56 Edited by Juanita Brooks. SCC: Utah State Historical Society, 1978. 135 pp., index. \$10.95.

Letters of Elizabeth Cumming, 1857-58 Edited with Introduction and Notes by Ray R. Canning and Beverly Beaton. SCC: Tanner Trust Fund, University of Utah Library, 1977. xvi + 101 pp., biblio, index. \$12.50.

The study of early Utah history has been notably enriched by the recent publication of two contemporary accounts from the 1850s. *The Journal of Martha Spence Heywood, 1850 to 1856* includes Martha's accounts of the trek west, life among Salt Lake City's leading families and the settling Salt Creek (Nephi). The *Letters of Elizabeth Cumming*, wife of the first "gentile" governor of Utah Territory, begins in August 1857 and continues over the next year when she began her life as first lady of the territory after she and her husband were escorted to Salt Lake City by Johnston's Army. Since Martha Spence married into one of the more prominent Utah families after her arrival in Salt Lake, it seems quite possible that the two women might have met during one of the frequent gatherings Mrs. Cumming held for members of the local gentry.

Both the journal and the letters are writ-

ten by intelligent and articulate women in their middle years. Both met the frontier experience as a privilege and adventure that more than compensated for its attendant hardships and discomforts. For example, within a few months of her arduous journey to Salt Lake City, Martha described a proposed emigration south to establish the settlement at Salt Creek as "a field of labor that I would delight in." She later described the prospective departure south with her new husband, Joseph Heywood, "a two-fold gleam of sunlight to lighten my dreary prospect." Elizabeth described her sojourn west and early weeks in Utah as the "happiest and pleasantest months" of her life. One wonders how many other well-bred Boston ladies would have thus described a 1500 mile trek across the wilderness. The Cummings' journey was beset by bitter cold winds and storms; provisions ran low and animals were killed by successful Mormon raiding parties. The trip included a six-month winter stopover in a mountain valley near Laramie where tents afforded the only protection against the winter cold.

But the differences between these two venturesome women and the accounts they left, are more interesting than their similarities. The most apparent and essential difference of course is that Martha Heywood's

is an "insider's" account. She participated fully in early Utah society and actively supported the values of the Mormon establishment. Elizabeth Cumming was a socio-culturally detached observer.

Martha Heywood's journal has long been regarded by the limited circle of scholars who have had access to it as one of the most compelling and valuable in the extensive LDS Church archives. She came to America from Dublin in 1834, a shy and sickly girl with no money and few skills, but she soon learned the capmaker's trade and managed to sustain herself. Martha joined the Mormon Church in July 1848 and, to quote her diary, "Immediately after I was baptized I conceived the necessity of being where the Church was and at once decided I would get there as quickly as possible." This reflects Martha's clear and straightforward writing style and her firm determination to reach her goals. Arriving in Salt Lake City in October 1850 Martha went to live at the Joseph L. Heywood home. He was bishop of the 17th Ward and a principal aide to Brigham Young. She became Heywood's third wife the following January.

Some of the most fascinating entries in Martha's journal describe social activities in the new Mormon capital. The combination of puritanical values and the polygamous family structure dictated customs very different from those prevalent in the rest of the country. Polygamous wives were allowed much greater freedom to travel about without their husbands than would have been thought proper at that time in the East. It was not unusual for Mormon wives to be escorted occasionally by men other than their husbands.

Martha's journal gives many accounts of her interactions with well-known church leaders. Especially enjoyable are her trenchant summaries of sermons delivered by Brigham Young and other general authorities. At her home in Nephi she frequently entertained President Young and other Mormon pilgrims as they travelled to and from the Dixie settlements.

The most valuable contribution the journal makes is the introduction it gives to a woman well worth knowing. Arriving in Salt Lake a sensitive, bookish, thirty-nine-year-old spinster with virtually no knowledge of cooking and other homemaking skills, within two years she became a wife,

mother, homemaker, colonizer, and hostess to the elite of Mormon society. The journal chronicles this transformation, though at times in tantalizingly brief detail. During the six years covered by her journal, Martha frequently lost the "buoyancy of spirits" she claimed to be hers by nature. But throughout the account she remains remarkably successful in communicating the passionate faith that was the propelling force in her life.

Elizabeth Cumming's "Utah War" letters, written mostly to a well-loved sister-in-law, contain both the strengths and weaknesses of this particular literary form. They are informative, entertaining and more polished, in a literary sense, than Martha's journal. But as one would expect, the letters tell us little about Elizabeth's soul. It would be instructive to read Elizabeth's own journal to which she often refers in her letters. The letters, however, make a substantial and distinctive contribution to our understanding of early Utah history. Governor Cumming could not have asked for a better helpmate in the difficult task of mediating between zealous Army officers eager for a fight and suspicious Mormon leaders willing to defend their land to the last breath. When the crisis passed and Johnston's Army was safely settled on the west shore of Utah Lake, Elizabeth greatly eased the new governor's early months in office with her tolerant and respectful behavior toward the Mormon majority, combined with sympathetic help for the disaffected minority who wished to leave.

The descriptive gem of the collection is a letter dated 17 June 1858 that gives a detailed account of the Cummings' trip from Camp Scott (their winter layover in Wyoming) to Salt Lake City, and their first days in the city. Elizabeth travelled (as she did most of the trip) on a pony, which allowed her considerable freedom to explore the spectacular canyons through which they descended as they approached the Salt Lake Valley. Particularly compelling is Elizabeth's description of their entry into the deserted city, beset by a "death-like stillness," unbroken even by the greeting of the Mormon leaders, since the welcoming delegation was waiting for the Governor's party at a different entrance to the Valley than the one actually taken by the federal officials. Not until after the army had marched through

the city and departed from its borders did the Mormons return to the capital they had threatened to burn.

The Heywood journal was edited by Juanita Brooks with the aid of Miriam B. Murphy from the Utah State Historical Society. The style of the footnotes is spare and to the point. One can see some virtue in allowing a document like Martha's journal to stand on its own without too much excess baggage in the form of discursive references. But there are places where we might have preferred greater exposure to Mrs. Brooks' wealth of historical and bibliographic knowledge of the period. Occasional footnotes, descriptive of Martha's feelings, irri-

tate the reader ("Martha must have felt flattered by this," etc.). Such interpretations belong only in an introduction.

The Cumming letter collection is beautifully printed and illustrated. The footnotes compiled by Beverly Beeton and Ray R. Canning are impressive research. The reader feels he/she is reading two accounts at the same time, one by Cumming and one by the editors since the notes are almost as interesting as the letters themselves.

CHERYLL LYNN MAY who lives in Salt Lake City, is currently completing a doctorate from the Fletcher School of International Relations.

FISHING FOR EMMA

by Linda King Newell

Joseph and Emma Companions by Roy A. Cheville. Independence, Missouri: Herald Publishing House, 1977. 206 pps. \$8.00.

Judge Me Dear Reader by Erwin E. Wirkus. Idaho Falls: by the author, 1978. 50 pps. \$1.50.

Accounts of Emma Hale Smith and her relationship with her husband Joseph are scattered, sketchy and superficial. In 1973 Irwin E. Wirkus published *Judge Me Dear Reader*, a little twenty-five-page booklet about Emma. This past year he released an expanded fifty-page version, spruced up with a cover picture of Florence Hansen's fine sculpture of Emma and Joseph. A melodramatic attempt to rescue Emma from the depths of hell to which Brigham Young had consigned her, *Judge Me* remains the only work on Emma Smith by an LDS writer. In the meantime, Roy A. Cheville, who holds the title "Presiding Patriarch Emeritus" of the RLDS Church, has written *Joseph and Emma Companions*. Although his book attempts to deal with the relationship between Joseph and Emma, it gives little more than a simple biographical sketch of their lives, padded with empty comparisons such as "Joseph and Emma were not identical." The

two authors have gone fishing in the same river but on opposite banks. Occasionally they hook a "keeper" but, for the most part, what they land is unpalatable.

Both Wirkus and Cheville have tried to explain Emma and her association with Joseph to the members of their respective churches, but their volumes were meant to be inspirational rather than scholarly. In their introductions, they explain why they wrote as they did. "Authentic resources are limited," says Cheville, "and various materials undoubtedly have been altered to uphold some doctrinal or historical position." A few decades ago a statement such as this might have been acceptable. Today, however, too many people have emptied the contents of their attics, basements, boxes and trunks into archives from coast to coast, making voluminous, authentic primary source material available to the serious writer. Had the author taken advantage of the archives—even in his own region—he might have avoided many of the errors in his book.

Wirkus offers this explanation:

It has always seemed to me that there is more said against Emma Smith . . .