

who found a hide and a jaw of an animal that "looked" like those of a horse. This does not mean that it was a horse, or even that it really looked like one: The chroniclers were actually writing after the Spanish had introduced the horse into Peru!

The strongest source that Dr. Cheesman used on these pages is none other than Joseph Smith's mother, Lucy Mack Smith. She stated that her son had told her that the ancient inhabitants of this continent had animals on which they rode. To those Mormons for whom this caps the argument it will matter little that a skeptic like me will ask what this had to do with any expertise or knowledge mother or son might have had on the matter. The innumerable times Cheesman invokes the name of a high Mormon Church person as an expert on some aspect of pre-Columbian Indian history,

makes it impossible for me, and I am sure for those who know more than I do, to take this work seriously. Even more disturbing is his quoting of respected archaeologists and historians out of context, with their speculations presented as facts. At the risk of seeming facetious, I must say that reading this book was like a trip to fantasy island for me!

I am willing to let past, present and future historical and archaeological experts verify the history of the horse. I am willing to allow that the history of pre-Columbian America is far from complete, but I hope that the search for that history will be continued by rational, somewhat skeptical men, who are searching for truth. This important study must not be left to those who already possess the truth and must therefore confirm it to the point of distorting it.

Those Apostates Who Would Be Gentiles

NEWELL G. BRINGHURST

The Gentile Comes to Cache Valley: A Study of the Logan Apostasies of 1874 and the Establishment of Non-Mormon Churches in Cache Valley, 1873-1913. By A. J. Simmonds. Logan, Utah: Utah State University Press, 1976 137 pp., \$5.00.

In an attractive volume with numerous illustrations, tables, and charts, A. J. Simmonds has told the story of those Cache Valley Latter-day Saints who for various economic, social or political reasons were excommunicated from or who voluntarily left the Mormon Church during the late nineteenth century. These ex-Mormons, or apostates, often cast their lot with various Protestant denominations active in the Valley at this time, thus becoming the gentiles to which Simmonds alludes in his title. More important, such apostates were sometimes appointed to federal offices in the valley

which enabled them to enforce the various antipolygamy laws passed by Congress during the late nineteenth century. In this way, these apostates, according to Simmonds, played a role in the "Americanization" or Reconstruction of Utah which culminated in the Manifesto of 1890.

In several respects Simmonds' work makes a contribution to our understanding of the Mormon past. It is somewhat of a pioneering work in that it uses "oral tradition" extensively—but carefully. Secondly, this history is a "case study" in the operation of Frederick Jackson Turner's "safety valve" thesis—that is, the settlement of unoccupied land by mobile, white settlers. In Cache Valley this "safety valve" operated in the exodus of apostates from the predominate Mormon areas of the valley to the unoccupied Big Range during the 1870's. Simmonds also brings to light a number

NEWELL G. BRINGHURST teaches history at Indiana University at Kocomo and is writing a book on race relations in the South.

of interesting and often overlooked facets of the Mormon past. In discussing the origins of the Cache Valley apostasies, Simmonds notes that the grounds for Mormon disfellowship or excommunication were much broader before 1890—going far beyond the clear-cut moral or doctrinal criteria used since. Simmonds vividly describes the potent, often heavy-handed activities of the Block Teacher's Quorum as a police force in those Cache County wards troubled with dissension and division. Finally, Simmonds shatters a popular Mormon myth by suggesting that nineteenth century Mormon-run schools were "second rate" when compared to the Mission Schools operated by the Protestants in not just Cache Valley, but throughout Utah Territory. This painful fact was dramatized by the frequent enrollment of children belonging to faithful Latter-day Saints in such Gentile-run schools.

Despite the book's assets, Simmonds' work suffers from a number of organizational and interpretive problems. First, Simmonds' chronological framework of 1873 to 1913 does not square with his own historical evidence. As Simmonds' narrative shows, 1869 rather than 1873 was the *real* beginning date of Cache Valley's apostasies. In 1869 a fateful split developed within Cache County's Latter-day Saint community with the apostasy of several Mormon merchants upset by the establishment in that year of the monopolistic Logan Cooperative Mercantile Institution. The year 1913 is also less than satisfactory as a terminal date, inasmuch as 1890 rather than 1913 marks the end—for all practical purposes—of Cache Valley's apostate-gentile community. The Manifesto of 1890, terminating the official church sanction of plural marriages, led to a marked decline of gentile-Mormon conflict. By 1890, the Church had abandoned its efforts to create an independent economic order separate from the larger non-Mormon society. Finally, 1890 marked the implementation of the Free School Act providing all Utah school children with free public education. This dealt a fatal blow to the Protestant mission school system in Cache Valley and elsewhere. These three developments undermined the entire gentile-apostate *raison de etre*.

Simmonds' hazy chronological focus dramatizes fundamental problems evident in the book's basic organization. For

example, the author in his initial chapter states that at the beginning of 1873 "near unanimity" prevailed among Cache Valley's residents with respect to basic "beliefs and practices." However, the historical evidence presented by Simmonds throughout this chapter suggest that this was *not* the case. Similar problems are evident throughout the book. Often, Simmonds' evidence does not square with his intended interpretive focus in a particular section or chapter. At the end of this work a lengthy series of appendicized biographical sketches of nineteen Mormon apostates further underscores the book's organizational problems. While such biographical information has a human interest value, Simmonds does not indicate his reasons for including this material or for selecting the particular individuals included.

Simmonds does not really move his interpretation of Cache Valley apostates beyond this region, despite claims to the contrary on the book's dust jacket. The author should have done more to relate his story to apostate-gentile activities in other Great Basin Mormon communities. While this work suggests a connection between the Cache Valley apostasies and the Salt Lake-centered Godbeite movement as reflected in the activities of W. H. Shearman, this issue is not pursued. And while suggesting that the apostasies in Cache County were not unique but were repeated in other Mormon communities, Simmonds does not develop this theme.

More could have been done to relate this work to Mormon history in general. After reading Simmonds' study, one is left wondering if there were any significant socio-economic or ethnic differences between Cache Valley apostates and those Latter-day Saints who remained true to the faith. Simmonds' work would have been more meaningful if he had attempted a comparative analysis. Such a socio-economic analysis, in place of the book's biographical appendices, would have provided further insights into the reasons certain individuals left the Mormon movement while others remained faithful. It would have also been interesting if Simmonds had probed the inability of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints to attract significant numbers of Cache Valley apostates. Such individuals usually joined the various Protestant