

Undoubtedly a number of the Golden anecdotes are in folk circulation; some have been published in folklore collections, and Hector Lee has issued a recording in which he retells some favorites. The anecdote titled "Built in a Day" is a well-known American folktale localized in various metropolises. In the present rendering, Golden is conducting some visiting dignitaries around Salt Lake City and pointing with pride to buildings speedily constructed by the Mormons. But his visitors put him down by saying that in their country they accomplish such feats in half the time. Finally the bus passes Temple Square and a dignitary points to the temple and asks what is the building. "Damned if I know," said Golden. "It wasn't there yesterday." Cheney assigns an informant for the tale, who turns out to be a fellow-folklorist, Jan Brunvand, but gives no further information. The "Cheney Collection" which is the main source cited may provide more explicit details on time, place, and narrator, but the folklorist would welcome this information here and he would request comparative annotation. Otherwise the reader cannot identify the folkloric anecdotes.

Still, the basic data is available here, in the form of verbatim texts from oral tradition for the anecdotes and typical sermon passages from Conference Reports. They provide the student of folk tradition with an unusual opportunity to view the evolving of a legend corpus from Kimball's own speech to the tales told on him by a widening circle. Kimball's rhetoric is fresh, strong, direct, and itself filled with anecdote, pithy quotation and down-to-earth sentiment. Like other American characters in tradition, he is the storyteller who himself becomes the subject of stories. In J. Golden Kimball's case, the career of an outspoken mule skinner who came to hold high ecclesiastical office has provided sure-fire ingredients for the burgeoning of anecdotal legend.

New Essays on Mormon History

WILLIAM J. GILMORE

The Restoration Movement: Essays in Mormon History. Edited by F. Mark McKiernan, Alma R. Blair and Paul Edwards. Lawrence, Kansas: Coronado Press, 1973. 357 pp. \$10.00

"It is still surprising," state the editors of this volume, "how little good material is available in many areas of Mormon history." To help correct this deficiency, F. Mark McKiernan of the Restoration Trails Foundation, and Alma Blair and Paul Edwards of Graceland College have collected a baker's dozen of essays, including one each by the editors, encompassing a broad range of topics basically within nineteenth century Mormon history. Only two of the thirteen essays concern themselves with the twentieth century. Ten essays focus on the Utah Latter-day Saints, two on the Reorganized Church, and one on the Strangite Church. Significantly, none of the essays has previously been published.

Chapters One through Six concern themselves with the formative years through Joseph Smith's assassination, beginning with Larry Porter's "The Church in New York and Pennsylvania, 1816-1831." Porter offers us a carefully constructed

narrative of many of the major events of Joseph Smith's life through the organization and incorporation of the Church. It is an interesting synthesis interweaving primary sources with most relevant secondary accounts (Fawn Brodie's biography being the most notably absent source).

"Kirtland, a Stronghold for the Kingdom" by Max H. Parkin is, likewise, a detailed presentation of the growth of Mormonism, "from an insignificant neighborhood religion to an enlarged and formidable Christian denomination" between late 1830 and July of 1838. Parkin concludes that even though Kirtland was initially viewed as a "temporary way-station to be endured before the Saints could fully enjoy their Missouri land of promise," soon it was thought that it would become "one of Zion's greatest stakes." Mormonism passed "from infancy to adolescence" at Kirtland, concludes Parkin. His blend of thorough primary source research with comprehensive coverage of secondary sources is very effective.

"The City in the Garden: Social Conflict in Jackson County, Missouri," by Warren Jennings is an entirely different kind of essay from those of Porter and Parkin in that Jennings eschews extensive primary source research for a thoughtful interdisciplinary consideration of the context of social conflict in Jackson County between summer 1831 and November 1833. "An analysis of the differences between the 'Saints' and the 'Gentiles,'" argues Jennings, "leads to the conclusion that the conflict was irrepressible," largely due to fundamental differences in cultural heritage and assumptions. The "Saints" were largely New Englanders while the "Gentiles," the original settlers, were mainly border states mountain people.

The next attempt to establish a religious community came at Far West, Missouri, discussed in F. Mark McKiernan's "Mormonism on the Defensive: Far West, 1838-1839." McKiernan presents a succinct narrative based on a combination of primary sources and contemporary and secondary histories. Heavy emphasis is placed on John Corrill's 1839 *Brief History of the Church*. "A costly failure" is McKiernan's conclusion for the Far West years. In fact, he concludes, "The Mormon leaders would have been exterminated had it not been for [a local supporter] General [Alexander] Doniphan's courage. As it was, most Mormon leaders spent six months in prison before escaping."

Two essays encompass the Nauvoo years. The first, "Dream and Nightmare: Nauvoo Revisited" by Robert Bruce Flanders is by far the best chapter of the six on the formative years. Basically, Flanders has rethought the main issues elaborated in his 1965 *Nauvoo: Kingdom on the Mississippi* and summed them up here in a coherent and well written overview. Henceforth Flanders' essay should be the starting point for the study of Nauvoo. The second essay, "Nauvoo and the Council of the Twelve" by T. Edgar Lyon, is a long, extremely detailed narrative of the Council and its domestic and foreign missionary activities from the mid-1830's through early 1846. Of these first six, Flanders' essay stands out in one major respect: a level of perspective, context, and balance is evident with him that is simply lacking in the other five essays. Jennings' thoughtful use of sociological theory on the Jackson County, Missouri, period is also noteworthy. The other four essays, while well researched and valuable, too readily reflect their shortness of perspective.

The story of the Utah Saints continues in a very brief albeit concise overview of "The Latter-Day Saints in the Far West, 1847-1900," by Leonard Arrington

and D. Michael Quinn, and a generally balanced and well researched investigation of "The Mormon Search for Community in the Modern World," by James B. Allen. Concentrating on the twentieth century challenge "to be 'in the world but not of it,'" Allen rightly stresses the success of the Church's struggle to develop a truly international frame of reference. His treatment of Black Americans and their relationship to twentieth century Mormonism leaves much to be desired, however. After stating that race relations and opposition to Vietnam were the two major social issues of the previous decade, Allen expends half a page on race and Mormonism followed by three pages on Vietnam and the Church. The content of the remarks on race is little better. Following the statement that the Church continues withholding the priesthood from "the Negro race," Allen patronizingly comments, the result was "that zealous reformers throughout the country found in this explosive issue a continuing basis for attacks upon the Church." Allen's further comments are more balanced but given the critical nature of the problem for a major religious denomination with nearly two million American members, more extensive treatment of the issues involved could reasonably have been expected. The terrible abuse and prejudice endured by earlier generations of Mormons in America tinges this matter with tragic irony. These remarks are meant less as criticism of Allen's otherwise fine essay than as a reminder of the necessity for greater sensitivity.

Of the remaining five essays, three are devoted to internal divisions. "The Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints: Moderate Mormons," by Alma R. Blair, is an intriguing study, mainly from primary sources, of the formation of the Reorganized Church focusing on the role of Joseph Smith III in shaping the nature and direction of the Church. "Theocratic-Democracy: Philosopher King in the Reorganization," by Paul M. Edwards, continues the story of the Reorganized Church by following the career of Joseph Smith III's son, Frederick M. Smith, beginning with his unanimous request to accept the Presidency of the Church by the 1915 Conference. "King James Strang: Joseph Smith's Successor?" by William D. Russell is a fascinating biographical sketch of James J. Strang (1813-50), the founder of the Strangite wing. The text of his alleged "letter of appointment" to succeed Joseph Smith is included as an appendix to the essay.

The remaining two essays—one by Davis Bitton and one by Klaus Hansen—are with Flanders' the best essays in the collection. Bitton's "Early Mormon Lifestyles; or the Saints as Human Beings" is a straightforward probe of the life of "the common people" of Mormonism, accenting place, food, shelter, family, work and play, and worship. Hansen's introduction to the volume, "Mormonism and American Culture: Some Tentative Hypotheses," is a provocative attempt to locate the place of Mormonism within the larger cultural geography of nineteenth century America. Reminiscent of a number of recent interpretations of a variety of groups, Hansen sees Mormonism as attractive to those people "who were left out of the hierarchy of values in the larger American society."

Overall, this is a very good collection of essays and provides a convenient summation of much of the best of recent scholarship on Mormonism in the nineteenth century. The title is a bit misleading, given the existence of Alexander Campbell and his followers. It would have been helpful to have an index, and more importantly a bibliography would truly have been a significant contribution, precisely because so many of the studies relied upon by the authors are unfamiliar to most

outside the Mormon community. The major weakness of the collection, however, is that significance and import are all too often sacrificed to detail. This said, it must be added that this is a plea for more interpretation but not for less first-rate research such as is exemplified here. This collection is a tribute to one segment of an emerging cohort of historians of Mormonism and they, together with other scholars such as Marvin S. Hill, are responsible for a serious rethinking of the origins, growth and meaning of Mormonism within American religious history.

A Collage of Modern Mormondom

JULIE G. CHRISTENSEN

A Daughter of Zion. By Rodello Hunter. New York: Alfred A. Knopf. 285 pp. \$6.95.

In *Dialogue's* maiden issue Rodello Hunter's *A House of Many Rooms* was reviewed as one of those books ". . . by Mormons for non-Mormons," a valid classification of the book. Mrs. Hunter's *A Daughter of Zion*, which was obviously written with the same purpose in mind, may not interest the Gentile audience as much as did her earlier book, because *A Daughter of Zion's* focus delineates everyday, here and now Mormon life, while the earlier book has the more universal view of a history of rural America with the Mormonism as seasoning, rather than a main course.

A much more probable and enthusiastic audience would be her fellow Mormons of all kinds, from the dedicated ones to "jack" Mormons. The former group may find themselves a little shocked by their own likenesses and Mrs. Hunter's doctrinal questions, but, I would guess, will be fascinated at the same time. And those whose stance in the Church reflects Mrs. Hunter's will find an entertaining echo of their feelings in the book. Thanks to her middle position outside the orthodox center of the Church but still inside its pales, Mrs. Hunter has written a book that honestly and tenderly palpates the Latter-day Saint life in all its celestial glory and terrestrial hypocrisy.

That *A Daughter of Zion* is aimed at non-Mormons and, I suspect, misses its target, adds to its charm. The capsule explanations of doctrine and custom are more likely to touch off a sympathetic nod, chuckle or squirm in the member reader than in the non-member. For example:

Most Mormons simply do not have the ability to oppose Church authority—this kind of dissent has been trained out of them since infancy.

In the huge General Conference gatherings, or in any other assembly where authorities are sustained year after year, there is always a unanimous aye vote—never a nay. I have known many people who would like to vote nay, myself for one, but we satisfy our consciences with abstention from voting. No one notices that.

Most Latter-day Saints (except those who haven't time or inclination to read non-doctrinal church works) will recognize their own quickly repressed feelings and thoughts in Mrs. Hunter's arguments with Papa, her grandfather and adopted father, about tithing: